



Plymouth Historic District Commission
Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, June 5, 2019 - 7:00p.m.
Plymouth City Hall Commission Chambers

City of Plymouth
201 S. Main
Plymouth, Michigan 48170-1637

www.plymouthmi.gov
Phone 734-453-1234
Fax 734-455-1892

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Polin called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

PRESENT: Jeremy Borys, Stan Cole, Linda May, Joshua Mrozowski, John Townsend and Colleen Polin

ABSENT: Linda Filipczak

Also present was Community Development Director, John Buzuvis and City Commission Liaison, Suzi Deal.

2. CITIZEN COMMENTS

None.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES

a) A motion was made by Comm. Borys and seconded by Comm. Townsend to approve the meeting minutes from April 3, 2019 as presented.

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

b) A motion was made by Comm. Borys and seconded by Comm. May to approve the study session minutes from May 1, 2019 as presented.

MOTION PASSED 5-1

Comm. Cole felt the study session meeting minutes were too similar to an agenda.

Mr. Buzuvis explained that all study session, sub-committee, and training meeting minutes are done in an outline format City-wide.

4. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

A motion was made by Comm. Cole and seconded by Comm. Townsend to move Commissioner Comments to after New Business.

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

5. OLD BUSINESS

A) H19-01: Wall and ground signage for 212 S. Main (2nd Revision)

Steven Bretz, sign contractor, and Derek Shaffer, applicant, spoke about the previous approval in April. Mr. Shaffer explained the final budget came in several thousand dollars over the initial budget with the extra costs for the gooseneck lighting, and redesigned ground sign and explained that he has returned to the HDC for review/approval of alternative lighting for the wall sign and a scaled back update to the existing ground sign. Mr. Bretz explained the sign on the building will remain as previously approved, but they are proposing to replace the expensive gooseneck lighting with LED strip lighting. Mr. Bretz explained that a 12.5-foot aluminum bar light painted to match the shingles with 24 LED lights of 9 lumens each will be projected to shine downward. The sign panel in the existing ground sign cabinet will be replaced on both sides with a sign that will have the Martinizing logo and phone number on it. He plans on repainting the case of the ground sign to Martinizing blue at a later date.

Board Discussion

Comm. Cole asked about the color of the aluminum bar. Mr. Bretz answered it will match the roof and be a silver grey. He asked how the conduit will get to the light source. Mr. Bretz explained the power source will be located on the inside of the building, with a tube concealing the tube coming through. He asked about the color temperature. Mr. Bretz stated it is a very soft white light. He asked if the wall sign lighting could be dimmed. Mr. Schaffer believed it would not be any brighter than the gooseneck lighting but could be dimmed if needed.

Comm. Townsend asked if the lighting would be on 24 hours a day. Mr. Schaffer explained it would be on a timer. He asked if the ground sign would light up. Mr. Schaffer responded that the ground sign can light up but currently does not and would require repair to the lighting fixtures.

Chair Polin stated that if the ground signage illumination method were to change it would need to come back before the Historic Board for review, but if it is just a replacing/repairing of the light bulbs it does not need to be reviewed.

A motion was made by Comm. Cole, supported by Comm. Townsend, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H19-01, 212 S. Main, revised wall and ground signage. Approval is based on the finding of facts that Section 18-654 (a)(3) and (a)(4) of the ordinance are met, with the following conditions:

1. Roof/Wall sign light bar materials to be made of aluminum, painted to match the roof.
2. The roof mounted sign to have all conduit/electrical connections hidden from view.
3. The roof mounted sign to have no visible light source
4. The roof mounted light source color temperature to be a warm white light and dimmable.
5. The ground signage light source can be repaired but not altered or modified to a different source.

MOTION PASSED 6-0.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A) H19-02: Ground signage for 271 S. Main

Hannah Gac, sign contractor, presented the board with samples of the signage materials and how they will be carved. Ms. Gac explained the signage size has been reduced and slightly lowered, per the ZBA's requirements. She explained the current sign will be removed, new painted black wood posts will be installed with the double-sided signage, as presented, with no lighting.

Board Discussion

Comm. Townsend asked if the signage would be 30" by 48" equaling 10 sq. ft. Ms. Gac confirmed.

Comm. Cole asked if the wood posts would be capped. The applicant stated there was no plan to cap the posts but could be capped if requested.

Comm. Cole asked that a black metal painted cap be provided to prevent damage from standing water.

Chair Polin asked for clarification of the Zoning Board of Appeals outcome. Mr. Buzuvis stated that the sign placement was approved by the ZBA.

A motion was made by Comm. Borys, supported by Comm. May, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H19-02, 271 S. Main, ground signage. Approval is based on the finding of facts that Section 18-654 (a)(3) and (a)(4) of the ordinance are met, with the condition that a black painted aluminum caps shall be placed on the wooden posts to match color of posts.

MOTION PASSED 6-0.

B) H19-03: Door replacement, signage, landscaping , and paint color for 305 Fleet Street.

Roman Bonislowski, architect, presented the Ebenezer Speakeasy project. He explained that they have Planning Commission approval to create a small lounge/bar in the lower level of 306 S. Main which has a main entrance off Fleet Street. He explained the rear of the building façade will be painted a pale ivory color and the existing canopy will be re-covered. He stated canister lighting will be added to the underside to illuminate the entrance in a sophisticated and safe way. Mr. Bonislowski explained that the aluminum and glass storefront will be removed and replaced with a banded wood door. He stated the awning will have the name “Ebenezer” on the front and be six square feet in size and no other signage is planned. He explained there will be some potted plants added at the rear entrance as well as some ivy planted to grow on an adjacent brick wall.

Board Discussion

Comm. Cole asked about the ivy and the applicant explained a Boston Ivy will be planted, attached to the wall and grow up the onto the brick wall located next to the awning.

Comm. Borys asked about the applicant obtaining a liquor license. Mr. Buzuvis explained that the project is an expansion of the existing liquor license for Greek Islands.

Comm. Mrozowski asked about the lighting located underneath the canopy. The applicant explained they are using a LED 3,000-degree Kelvin, but it may go down to 2,800 degrees for ambiance. The 2 or 3 lights will be black cylinder cans surface mounted onto a junction box.

The Board discussed work previously completed on the front exterior limestone coating put on many years ago by the applicant. There was also discussion on Dean Saddler’s façade applying paint onto masonry. The board considered requesting the property owner to come before the board to discuss the above-mentioned items that were completed but had not been previously approved and which did not appear to be in accordance with Secretary of Interior Standards. The board took action of approving the recent submittal (for the awning) contingent on this applicant coming before the board with an application for the non-approved work.

A motion was made by Comm. Cole, supported by Comm. Townsend, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H19-03, 305 Fleet Street, door replacement, signage, landscaping, and paint color. Approval is based on the finding of facts that Section 18-654 (a)(1), (a)(2), (a)(3), and (a)(4) of the ordinance are met and numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 9 of the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are met, with the following conditions:

1. Ivy is planted with 6-inch cores into the ground, and 48 inches on center.
2. LED Lighting - using black housing 2,800 Kelvin
3. The HDC requests that the building owner apply to the HDC regarding the limestone coating.

MOTION PASSED 6-0.

C) H19-04: Door and siding replacement , and front porch renovation for 284 S. Union Street.

Mike Salt, architect, presented the renovation project. He explained that the porch will remain the same size along with the soffit, ceiling, and roof, with repair and replacement to the damaged areas. He explained the columns would be new with a different shape and a stone finish. Mr. Salt stated the porch steps will be removed and rebuilt of wood material and painted to match the porch finish.

Board Discussion

Comm. Townsend asked if there was any lighting in the ceiling soffit. The applicant responded that there is one light that will remain.

Comm. Cole explained that the house is a contributing structure and must be reviewed under the Secretary of Interior Standards. He explained when materials area replaced, they are required to be

replaced like for like. He explained that it is not recommended to change the appearance of the house unless historical photographic evidence or physical documentation showing it once looked like this. He felt that it was inappropriate to add stone onto the house and to change the shape of the columns on the porch.

Chair Polin felt the Standards do not support changing the entire facade of the home into an arts and crafts home.

Comm. Cole suggested that the applicant looking under the existing siding to see if trim board is underneath and add the trim board back, if it exists.

A motion was made by Comm. Cole, supported by Comm. Borys, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H19-04, 284 S. Union Street, door and siding replacement, and front porch renovation. Approval is based on the following finding of facts:

1. No historic photos, evidence, or documentation has been provided to support the need to replace historic building elements or materials.
2. The porch is being restored and being replaced with different materials in appearance.
3. The proposed project does not meet numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 9 of the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
4. The proposed project does not meet Section 18-654 (a)(1), (a)(2), (a)(3), and (a)(4) of the City's ordinance.

MOTION FAILED 0-6.

The Board discussed the following items which should be provided:

1. Provide siding profile/sample. The color can be changed but the siding profile will need to match and material match or be upgraded.
2. If there was no trim historically, then no trim can be added.
3. The porch and doors must can only be replaced like for like.
4. The columns should be square.
5. Details on the light above the side door.
6. Details on the ceiling soffit light on porch.

The Board discussed that an alternate July meeting date will need to be determined.

D) H19-05: Awning with signage for 583 W. Ann Arbor Trail

Donna Pupa, applicant, presented her renovation project. She described the proposed awning. She proposed installing the awning above the entrance door to the shop in place of the signage that is currently there. Ms. Pupa explained she needs the signage as soon as possible, due to the possible sale of the building.

Board Discussion

Comm. Cole stated this building is a contributing structure that has guidelines to be reviewed from the Secretary of Interior Standards. He stated when the study was done in 1994 there was not an awning present. He explained that the Secretary of Interior Standards references store fronts. He explained that the Standards do not recommend adding vinyl awnings, awnings that are inappropriately sized or shaped, awnings that do not extend the entire length of the storefront, or awnings which are incompatible with the historic character of the building. He stated the awning should extend along the entire front of the building to comply with the Secretary of Interior standards.

The Board discussed possible signage and approving the awning with conditions.

A motion was made by Comm. Cole, supported by Comm. Borys, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H19-05, 583 W. Ann Arbor Trail, awning with signage. Approval is based on the finding of facts that Section 18-654 (a)(1), (a)(2), (a)(3), and (a)(4) of the ordinance are met and numbers 1, 2, 4, 5, 9, and 10 of the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are met, with the following conditions:

1. The awning does not change the historic character of the building.
2. The support system for the awning be made of a non-corrosive aluminum.
3. The awning be attached to the mortar joints of the building with stainless steel or aluminum fasteners.
4. The awning must extend the entire width of the tenant storefront building covering both display windows and the entry door.
5. The existing signage be removed, and any holes be tuck pointed with mortar.

MOTION PASSED 6-0.

7. COMMISSION COMMENTS

None.

8. REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

Mr. Buzuvis told the board the Annual Michigan Historic Preservation Network training is tentatively scheduled for September or October 2019.

9. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Comm. Borys, supported by Comm. Townsend, to adjourn the meeting at 9:22p.m.

MOTION PASSED 6-0.