



**City of Plymouth
Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes**

201 S. Main Street Plymouth, MI 48170
Wednesday, March 7, 2018, 7:00 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Polin called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM.

PRESENT: Stan Cole, Joe Hawthorn, Linda May, Joe Philips, John Townsend and Colleen Polin

ABSENT: Jeremy Borys

Also present was Community Development Director, John Buzuvis.

2. CITIZEN COMMENTS

None.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES

A motion was made by Commissioner Philips and seconded by Commissioner Hawthorn to approve the meeting minutes of December 6, 2017 as amended, February 7, 2018 as amended & February 12, 2018 as presented.

4. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

A motion was made by Commissioner Philips and seconded by Commissioner Hawthorn to revise the agenda, moving Number 5, Commission Comments to follow Number 9, Reports and Correspondence and Number 6 Election of Officers to follow Number 8 Old Business, as amended.

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

5. NEW BUSINESS

a) H 18-03: Porch Remodel & Landscaping Removal Review of 270 S. Union

Joseph Debone, owner, presented his case and explained he had four proposals with information on each.

The Porch- The bead board was replaced along with three six inch recessed lighting fixtures with bronze caps added in the ceiling. Mr. Debone presented samples of the bead board to the board members.

Remove Bushes – The applicant would like to remove the overgrown bushes on both sides of the porch and replace them with grass.

Replace Steps – The steps have holes and are dangerous to walk up. The steps will be replaced with pressure treated lumber.

Porch and Side Lights - Mr. Debone would like to have one placed at the front entrance above the mailbox and the other by the side entrance, a sample light fixture was also given to the board members.

Commissioner Comments

Vice Chair Cole explained the Secretary of Interior Standards four guidelines that the commission follows by retaining what was there, to protect, to repair and as a last resort replace. Commissioner Cole asked if the new bead board matches what was replaced and Mr. Debone answered he believes so. Mr. Debone explained the need to replace the railing with the exact same dimensions and type. Mr. Debone indicated he will not be replacing the latticework located below the porch. Commissioner Cole read the HDC study of this home to the applicant and stated the porch is a character defining feature and suggested using pendant lights instead of recessed down lighting.

Commissioner Hawthorne asked about the temporary front door and Mr. Debone answered it was removed and stored so that it does not get damaged, it will be one of the last things to be re-installed.

Chair Polin asked about the gutter agreement, if he has decided to use the half round type and Mr. Debone answered due to the cost he decided to install the half moon type by himself.

Commissioner Philips stated a lot of work has already been done and at the last meeting a specific comment was made that no work was to be done prior to approvals. Commissioner Philips would like the owner to provide photos of the areas prior to the replacements done to show the condition of it, warranting it to be replaced and therefore justified. Commissioner Philips would prefer the lighting to be something more dated.

There was discussion regarding replacing the railing and latticework for the same exact material and design.

Chair Polin indicated that the railing and the latticework is not part of tonight's review and explained to Mr. Debone no work, with the exception of maintenance and repair as necessary with exact materials is to be done on the railings until he returns to the board for approval.

Commissioner Philips indicated that if all of the boards on the porch are to be replaced then that is changing it and not regular maintenance, but if a few boards are replaced that would be a repair. Commissioner Philips would like only one pendant light on the porch.

Mr. Debone felt if it has been previously approved or exists that he should not be denied and indicated that the home across the street was approved for the same lighting as Mr. Debone is requesting. Chair Polin explained to Mr. Debone that the can lighting fixture has never come before this board for review, and suggested using the pendant or other more historical looking light. Mr. Debone indicated that he would prefer keeping the recessed lighting.

Commissioner Philips commented that extreme leniency was given to the applicant with the past approvals of the windows, doors, siding trim, etc. and the board will need to vote as if nothing has been done even though the lighting and wiring have already been installed with this submittal.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cole, supported by Comm. Townsend, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H18-03, 270 S. Union, porch remodel & landscape removal, provided the following conditions are met:

1. Front shrubs to be removed and replaced with grass.
2. Porch ceiling soffit lighting revised to a single pendant light, per the historic 2000 year photo.
3. Boards replaced on steps for deterioration only.
4. Side light fixture on porch accepted as submitted.
5. Fill in the ceiling holes with bead board, where the lights were previously located.

Finding of Fact: Sec. 18-654 (3): Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

YES COLE, MAY, TOWNSEND AND POLIN

NO HAWTHORNE AND PHILIPS

MOTION PASSES.

6. OLD BUSINESS

a) H 18-02: Addition and Exterior Alterations Review of 777 W. Ann Arbor Trail

Tomas Van Staden and Mike Collins went over the changes made since the last special meeting that was postponed for further review. Specifically the board requested the following items be included with the next submission:

1. Elevated "streetscape" type view of the rooftop area
2. Product data, details for the door (color, glass type etc.), dimensioned drawings for the door, renderings with the door closed and open
3. Details related to the door framing and opening size
4. Confirmation of colors for paint (in all locations), window frame colors, type of glass to be used, and other materials to be used
5. Applicants consideration and response to changing the porcelain panels to a different, less modern, material
6. If the applicant decides to pursue approval for the lower half of the building first and the rooftop at a later date that should be delineated in the next submission

The applicant stated Bigalora (Biga) and Arbor Brewing will share the building at 777 W. Ann Arbor Trail. The buildings renovations will include the following:

- The **front façade set back to break up the scale and the doorway height reduced**
- The elevations and cross sections are provided.
- The roof top Jakob wire trellis system that will hold the ivy.
- The glass rail will be replaced with a low iron glass. The top cap will be made of cypress wood on smooth galvanized steel post and top rails.
- The metal panel system located behind the seating area will be replaced with a reclaimed western red cedar screen wall
- A new brick cornice will replace the existing metal cornice.
- A reclaimed western cedar will be used for caging in the HVAC equipment.
- The windows will have glass on the outside and wood on the inside.

The applicant presented samples of the materials to be used.

Commissioner Comments

- Vice Chair Cole was concerned about the scale of the glass garage door & silver metal panel. Commissioner Cole asked if the fixed transom with gun metal finish would be put in on the glass door and if the ivy was being changed to boxwoods and the applicant replied yes they were. Vice-Chair Cole explained the inconsistencies with the Secretary of Interior Standards such as the scale of the door being too large and appears to be a service door, the addition appears to be significantly incompatible with the rest of the building.
- Chair Polin asked if the newly proposed railing with the cypress wood caps would weather well and be rot proof and the applicant answered that the cypress is rot proof and is long-lasting material
- Commissioner Townsend asked if the glass railings will have a prism effect when the sun hits them and the applicant answered the glass is not a reflective type and does not have the capability to reflect, the glass they choose is the purist and contains no coloring and the glass is also set back from the cornice of the building. Commissioner Townsend also asked if the mosaic tiles behind the fireplace would be allowed according to the fire code and the applicant answered there are no fire codes for mosaic tiles located on a gas fireplace.

Board Discussion

Commissioner Philips

- Commissioner Philips indicated that in his opinion the glass railings will have glare regardless of the type of glass used and the metal panels are of a material that is not historic looking.
- Commissioner Philips indicated he would like the applicant to return for review if anything on the **façade changes**.
- Commissioner Philips commented that he feels the applicant may need to have two means of egress from the roof top area and may need to return to this board with revisions.
- Commissioner Philips indicated that if any plant material is attached to the building he would prefer that it is done with the wire trellis system to hold it.
- Commissioner Philips stated that if anything is to be attached to the adjacent building that they receive permission from the owner beforehand.
- Commissioner Philips commented that he is not in favor of the **east façade** wood material being used.
- Commissioner Philips commented that he is very excited for the project and the applicant has made some nice revisions to the building.

Commissioner Townsend

- Commissioner Townsend commended the applicant on a fine job and representation and also appreciated the adjustments made.
- Commissioner Townsend has some concerns with the possible glare coming from the glass railing and also the baked enamel, he suggested using a more subtle way of distinguishing the two separate businesses.

Chair Polin

- Chair Polin spoke about following the Secretary of Interior Standards with the compatibility of the surrounding buildings, scale & setting. Chair Polin suggested using a limestone which would be a more softer and earthy look. Chair Polin spoke about a possible contingency for the roof top Ordinance which states using either sidewalk or rooftop but maybe both.

Mayor Pro-Tem Pobur (HDC Liaison from the City Commission)

- Mayor Pro-Tem Pobur discussed a previous meeting held with the Liquor license review and the City Commission where the roof top scenario was discussed. It was decided to have the administration go through this Ordinance along with any pertaining ordinances for proposed changes to be made. The general agreement was that you could either have roof top dining or a sidewalk café but not both.

There was discussion and it was suggested to obtain a variance for just paragraph "B" or also suggested was to make a motion to have rooftop standing. There was also discussion with the applicant regarding changing the enamel panels to limestone, replacing the glass railing with a cable and the nano wall possibly in a natural stone

Citizen Comments

None

A motion was made by Comm. Philips, supported by Comm. Hawthorne, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of H18-02, 777 W. Ann Arbor Trail, addition and exterior alterations, with the following conditions:

1. Excluding any changes made to the documents.
2. No signage
3. No additional roof top equipment.
4. The glass railing located on the second floor shall be replaced with a cable system.
5. The baked enamel panels shall be replaced with limestone.
6. The large door(west side) illustrated remains as shown.
7. No attachments to the neighbor's building without approval.
8. All exterior fasteners will be non-corrosive.
9. All glass will be clear glass.
10. All construction done will be done as submitted.

YES HAWTHORNE, MAY, TOWNSEND AND POLIN
NO COLE AND PHILIPS
MOTION PASSES.

6. - ELECTION OF OFFICERS:

ELECTION OF CHAIRPERSON

John Buzuvis asked for nominations for Chairperson

Comm. Hawthorne nominated Chair Polin as Chairperson.

John Buzuvis asked for any other nominations.

There being no other nominations, the nominations were closed and there was a unanimous vote of approval for Comm. Polin as Chairperson.

CHAIR POLIN RE-ELECTED UNANIMOUSLY.

ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIRPERSON

Chair Polin asked for nominations for Vice-Chairperson.

Comm. Philips nominated Comm. Cole as Vice-Chairperson.

Chair Polin asked for any other nominations. There being no other nominations the nominations were closed and there was a unanimous vote of approval for Comm. Cole as Vice-Chairperson.

COMM. COLE RE-ELECTED UNANIMOUSLY.

9. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Commissioner Philips would like to review the By-Laws with a sub-committee consisting of: Commissioner Philips, Commissioner Townsend and Commissioner May

10. ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further business, a motion was made by Commissioner Hawthorne, supported by Commissioner Townsend to adjourn the meeting at 9:10 PM.

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY