



**CITY OF PLYMOUTH
MEETING MINUTES**

201 S Main, Plymouth, MI 48170
Ph (734) 453-1234 Fax (734) 455-1892
<http://www.ci.plymouth.mi.us>



CITY OF PLYMOUTH
CITY COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
201 S. MAIN STREET, PLYMOUTH, MI 48170
MONDAY, JANUARY 3, 2017, 7:00 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER:

PRESENT:

Mayor Daniel Dwyer, Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott, Commissioners Colleen Pobur, Daniel Dalton, Suzie Deal, Joe Valenti

ABSENT: Commissioner Mike Wright

Also present was City Manager Paul Sincock, sitting in for City Attorney Robert Marzano was Attorney Jeffrey Schroeder and various City Department Heads.

CITIZEN COMMENTS:

Lee Jasinski, 1380 Maple, responded to the administrations recommendation regarding the tree ordinance. He stated that the City is supposed to be a "Tree City" and spoke about his concerns with trees being cut down and big homes being built. He feels the moratorium should have been put in place and it is taking way too long to resolve this issue.

Allen Ardanowski, 1120 Maple, spoke about meeting minutes for last year referencing a particular zoning ordinance concerning the average height of a home in the City of Plymouth. He asked for clarification and provided the information to the Mayor for review.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:

3. A motion was made by Commissioner Colleen Pobur and seconded by Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott for approval of the Agenda for Monday, January 3, 2017.

MOTION PASSED 6 – 0

ENACTMENT OF THE CONSENT AGENDA:

4a. Approval of December 19, 2016 City Commission Regular Meeting Minutes –

A motion was made by Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott and seconded by Commissioner Daniel Dalton for approval of the Consent Agenda for January 3, 2017.

MOTION PASSED 6 – 0

COMMISSION COMMENTS: None

OLD BUSINESS: None

NEW BUSINESS:

6a. Zoning Ordinance Amendment – Floor Area Ratio – 2nd Reading -

City Manager Paul Sincock spoke about the issue of home sizing and massing that has been a topic of much discussion over the past several years. The City Commission has made several changes in the Zoning Ordinances over the year in an effort to address the size and mass issues of some new construction.

The City Planning Commission is recommending that the City Commission amend the Zoning Ordinances, Section 78 to accommodate the language related to Floor Area Ratio and to introduce this concept into the Ordinances. The Commission requested some additional information related to

this subject matter, specifically related to some possible alternative ratios for the final Ordinance. The City Commission has the option of choosing the Floor Area Ratio from anywhere between a .4 and a .6, should they decide to choose one of those options. A motion was made by Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott and seconded by Commissioner Colleen Pobur to open up for discussion regarding the resolution proposed.

Joe Elliott, 404 Irvin, Plymouth, did a study of a ratio analysis on homes in certain areas and pulled data from the website and did a quick assessment on three categories. He feels that having a .4 FAR would be effective to keep down the huge homes being built and he encourages the Commission to adopt this resolution being proposed.

Ellen Elliott, 404 Irvin, Plymouth, stated that she and her husband have been attending a lot of the Planning Commission meetings and her opinion is that a .4 FAR is pushing it and will not solve the problem. But, she does feel that it does make sense to stick with what the Planning Commission has recommended.

Jennifer Kehoe, 418 Blunk, Plymouth, stated the Planning Commission has spent a lot of time on researching information for this ordinance. She did some calculations at .45 and feels they would be doing nothing at this level and feels people want to see a change. They have run a lot of numbers at various calculations and would love this ordinance to pass.

Valerie Henigan, 550 Jener Pl., Plymouth, spoke about a huge home that was built next to her and it blocks all the sunlight to her home. She stated the builder has done damage to her property during the process and the Mayor has been there to see what has been done. The builder is not taking care of problems they create around the City. The lot is built to .53 and there were all kinds of issues with the builders and such a small lot that there is stuff all over the place. She does not want to see others go through this.

Jennifer Gladd, 325 Parkview, Plymouth, supports the resolution and the ordinance brought forth and all the work done to put this together. She feels most residents feel homes being built are too large and respects the rights of owners to do what they wish to build within the rules. House massing has been a discussion for years and is a real problem. She urges the City Commission to trust the Planning Commission and their decisions with the proposed ordinance.

Ed Krol, 1108 Beech, Plymouth, stated that some communities have a .3 FAR and had questions concerning garages

Andrea Ackerman, a Plymouth residents, supports the ordinance before the City Commission and feels the Planning Commission proposal is in line and they did a lot of hard work. The house being built to where she lives has caused extensive damage to her property and the property is slightly higher than she thinks it should be. She has lived in the City a very long time and does not mind these proposed changes and feels that they are necessary at this point.

Barry Smescu, 1375 William, Plymouth, spoke about the survey that the Planning Commissioners put together and got out over the internet and in the mail. He stated they did a lot of hard and thorough work with this survey and the response was very good.

John Townsend, 1312 Penniman, Plymouth, thanked the Planning Commissioners for all their hard work. He lives in one of the older homes on Penniman and his lot is referred to as a "postage stamp". He did an expensive addition in 2000 and very surprised his wife is planning an additional 1,000 foot expansion. He feels they should listen to the residents and pass this amendment at a .4 FAR.

Elizabeth McKenna, 974 Penniman, Plymouth, supports everything being said and feels the Planning Commission came up with a good ordinance and would like to see the resolution passed. She would like for young people to be able to afford the opportunity to buy a home in the City. She feels the huge homes being built are definitely changing the community.

A resident at 521 Adams, Plymouth, stated he feels that there should be reasonable time for implementation of the amendment. Throughout the City there have been homes that are built very well and there needs to be a balance within the community.

Corey Petro, 382 Adams, Plymouth, stated she can appreciate all that is being said. She loves the City and the diversity of the homes and plans to build a new home here on a 50 x 120' lot. She feels that this will prohibit people from wanting to build under these guidelines and will stunt growth and the City will lose revenue.

Patrick Kehoe, 418 Blunk, Plymouth, stated he has lived here many years and did expand and doubled the size of his home. He has a comfortable home and feels .4 FAR is a good size. If the neighbor could build at .45 FAR they would be on top of his home. He feels choosing to live in a small town and .4 is reasonable and could always be changed down the line.

Larry Chute, 546 S. Evergreen, Plymouth, agrees with the change and would propose for consideration to enlarge the ratio to a .45. There are some very tastefully done renovations and additions that keep more of the character of the home.

Anthony Schippa, 924 Church, Plymouth, stated he is a third generation homeowner. He stated the history of Plymouth is the back bone of the City and upset with the looks of the homes being built is changing the City.

Barbara Pope, 551 N. Evergreen, Plymouth, stated she is a home owner and a realtor and sympathizes with residents feeling encroached on with homes being built around them. She feels if they make adjustments to this ordinance they will affect home pricing in the City and no one has talked about this that she is aware of.

Mr. Knudsen, 246 Sunset, Plymouth, built a home on William Street and appreciates all the work done by the builder. He asked the Commissioners to take their time making any changes to the FAR and think about the residents. They will have huge effects and hopes they don't want to turn people away that would like to buy or build a home in the City.

Dave Workman, 496 Ann, Plymouth, thanked everyone for all the hard work done on the proposed amendment and this project has been ongoing for years by request of residents. He hopes the Commission supports the change and not wait to implement it. He feels the Planning Commissioners work has been rich and deep and the research was done very thorough.

Daniel Sabo, Taylor resident, stated he has family in town and a history and cares very deeply. He has 191 years of family history in his family's home and if demos of homes in the City continue, all the historical feel and looks of Plymouth will be gone. He feels that the Commission should adopt the ordinance being proposed

Mike Fisher, 1466 Penniman, Plymouth, stated the reason he bought his home was because of the charm of the City and feels the control needs to happen and agrees with the change being proposed. Scott Silvers, 883 Sutherland, Plymouth, stated he is a Planning Commission member and he gave a history of the FAR so everyone could understand what it meant. He stated this is a planning tool for engineers. He stated that they should not let economics sway their decision.

Kevin O'Keefe, 1455 Penniman, Plymouth, stated he is a builder and this is the third time around that this is being adjusted. He has built home and renovated homes in the City and has three homes being proposed for work. With the new regulations in place he probably would not get the contract and is very concerned what it will do to potential work for builders.

Timothy Carson, 309 Auburn, Plymouth, stated he rebuilt over ten years ago and his home would not have passed today's standards. The attic and the garage would be an issue and asked the Commission to reconsider increasing the FAR.

A resident at 1351 Hartsough, Plymouth, stated she is a realtor, owns properties and her husband is a

builder. If this amendment is passed the price of homes will deteriorate. She is concerned with limiting jobs for construction workers. The majority of homes are nice looking and bring change to the City. She is against the amendment being proposed and feels the survey done is not supportive of the proposed amendment because the responses were just certain areas of the City.

Barry Smescu, 1375 William, Plymouth, stated that there were 1,035 residents that responded to the survey from the Planning Commission.

Jim Mulhern, 396 Arthur, Plymouth, stated he is the Chairman of the Planning Commission and provided an overview of how the Planning Commission came to the conclusion of the .4 ratio. He stated they worked very hard for two years gathering data and calculations and are unpaid volunteers. They worked closely with the City Planner and they did take a lot of community input at the meetings they held and they stand by their recommendation.

Noah Allor, 223 Pinewood, Plymouth, stated he lives in a condo in town along with his wife and they looked around and wanted to live in the City but every time they found a suitable home and builder would buy it up for cash and tear it down and build a huge home on the property. He feels that this proposed ratio will afford young families who want to buy a home in the City of Plymouth to do so. He is in favor of the proposed ordinance at a ratio of .4 FAR.

Adam Szymczak, 333 Sunset, Plymouth, stated he has been in attendance to many of the Planning Commission meetings and feels that they need to strike a balance so they do not turn away anymore potential buyers in the City. He feels the .4 FAR would work for him as a starting point. Commissioner Daniel Dalton thanked everyone in attendance and feels it is very important to listen to everyone's opinions and the Planning Commission did a great job. He does feel that the .4 FAR is a good point and has been an ongoing discussion for at least two years.

Commissioner Suzi Deal thanked the Planning Commission for all their time and agrees with the .4 FAR being proposed. She did serve d on the Planning Commission and knows firsthand how hard these individuals work and are not compensated for all the hours they devote to the City.

Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott thanked everyone that came to the meeting and attended Planning Commission meetings and care about what goes on in their community. He thanked the Planning Commissioners and all their time and research for data and calculations involved in this process. He was skeptical of the .4 FAR and feels that 4.5 would be a good point but after listening to comments, he would be comfortable with a .4 FAR.

Commissioner Joe Valenti thanked the Planning Commission and feels the Commissioners should take advice from them after all their research. He stated that after much thought he was focused on the .45 FAR and feels that he would like to understand, but having a hard time with this whole issue. He feels they should add consideration of all the data being proposed and the property owners that have pending contracts and construction in place. He is inclined to go with the .4 FAR, but would like some mechanism in place to allow the projects already in place to be able to go forward before adoption of this ordinance.

Commission Colleen Pobur stated one of her concerns is the dramatic change in the size of a home. She spoke about building an addition years ago and under this new ordinance being proposed she would be in the .45 range and over the limit. Housing needs have changed and respects work done by the Planning Commissioners. She would like to see consideration for .45 FAR for housing needs and real estate needs. She likes some of the new homes and some not so much and it is all a matter of taste and what fits. She does like the floor ratio issue and feels that they could review further down the line and change to whatever does not work and what works.

Mayor Daniel Dwyer thanked everyone for dialogue and he came into the meeting feeling that the .45 FAR would be best and more comfortable. He stated that he would be agreeable to the .4 FAR because it seems like it is what the residents seem to want adopted in this amendment. He asked the Commissioners to be agreeable to having this ordinance effective 30 days after publication in

order to give the builders time to get their pending projects through the process.

A motion was made by Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott and seconded by Commissioner Colleen Pobur for adoption of the proposed resolution and the ordinance adoption date 30 days after publication.

MOTION PASSED 5 - 1

7. NEW BUSINESS : None

8. REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE:

Mayor Dwyer spoke about the passing of Dave Siegrist and he was a great member of the community and did a lot of volunteer work and was very involved. Prayers and good wishes go to his family as they mourn their loss. He will be greatly missed.

Commissioner Pobur stated that since Commissioner Wright was absent that she did have an appointment to bring forth for approval by the City Commission.

Planning Commission - Shannon Adams, 1231 Sheridan

A motion was made by Commissioner Colleen Pobur and seconded by Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott for approval of the appointment to the Planning Commission of Shannon Adams.

MOTION PASSED 6 – 0

ADJOURNMENT:

9. Hearing no further business, a motion was made by Commissioner Colleen Pobur and seconded by Mayor Pro-tem Oliver Wolcott for adjournment of the meeting at 8:49 p.m..

MOTION PASSED 6 – 0